



University of Huddersfield Repository

Leeming, Dawn and Boyle, Mary

Shame and using mental health services: Connection and validation or alienation and objectification?

Original Citation

Leeming, Dawn and Boyle, Mary (2013) Shame and using mental health services: Connection and validation or alienation and objectification? In: 8th biennial conference of International Society of Critical Health Psychology, July, 2013, Bradford, UK.

This version is available at <http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/18593/>

The University Repository is a digital collection of the research output of the University, available on Open Access. Copyright and Moral Rights for the items on this site are retained by the individual author and/or other copyright owners. Users may access full items free of charge; copies of full text items generally can be reproduced, displayed or performed and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided:

- The authors, title and full bibliographic details is credited in any copy;
- A hyperlink and/or URL is included for the original metadata page; and
- The content is not changed in any way.

For more information, including our policy and submission procedure, please contact the Repository Team at: E.mailbox@hud.ac.uk.

<http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/>

Shame and using mental health services:

Connection and validation or alienation and objectification?

Dawn Leeming¹ & Mary Boyle²

¹. University of Huddersfield; ². University of East London



Aim:

- To explore how mental health services risk exacerbating the emotional problems they are charged to address
 - focus on the issue of shame

Providing help to deal with feelings of shame

I feel worthless

I'm a pathetic piece of
*** - I feel better
when I've hurt myself

*I binge / drink to stop myself feeling so
bad about myself, and then I feel
ashamed of my behaviour*

*I just wanted to hurt him - he
made me feel so stupid*

I couldn't cope, I still
can't cope - I'm a
disgrace. I should be
able to cope.

*I feel stupid & clumsy &
inadequate in front of others*

*There's something
wrong with me -
I'm going mad*



Shame in the eyes of the other

- Shame has sometimes been viewed by clinical theorists as negative self-evaluation (e.g. Tangney; Lewis)

However, often shame is a social phenomenon

- A painful awareness of one's devaluation in the eyes of the potential or actual other (e.g. Goffman; Erikson; Satre; Scheff; Gilbert)
- Useful concept for thinking about how external positioning by others (or possibility of this) gets inside
- Importance of social context for repairing shame

Conditions for repairing shame

Theory & recent empirical findings tell us:

Connection

Articulating &
acknowledging
shame

Empowerment




Acceptance,
validation, compassion

Normalisation &
contextualisation
of experiences

(Brown, 2006; Gilbert & Proctor, 2006; Leeming & Boyle, 2012; van Vliet, 2008)

Art work credit: Hero-in-shame,
Deviantart.com



Can mental health services provide these conditions?

- Numerous critiques of mental health services for disempowering, degrading, **blaming service users** (e.g. Chamberlin, 1988; Johnstone, 2000; Newnes, Holmes & Dunn, 1999, 2001; Boyle, 2002; Coles, Keenan & Diamond, 2013)
- Becoming a user of mental health services can invoke highly stigmatising identity



Our data

From project on managing potential for shame in accessing mental health services:

- Interviews with 22 service-users 15-89 yrs
- One of themes: *Being diminished by staff*
 - subthemes: *negative judgements; alienation & rejection; restriction of autonomy; involuntary exposure & scrutiny*

“it was humiliating...cos it was like I was like on trial, every week when I went to a ward round....they’re all sitting there with their clipboards like saying ‘Oh yes, you’re still not eating enough’ And you just sit there and... I hated it...they were constantly criticising me.”

“I got lower in my state of mind. I didn’t feel like a person, I felt like a number somewhere... stuck away somewhere, like a number”

“some of the staff I got on with and some I didn’t, because I found some were very arrogant and they couldn’t care less. You were there as a patient and that’s how you stopped and their word was law”

I’ve had other psychiatrists and it’s just like er I’m just a face on medication, and whether I’m stable or not, you know like safe, but that doesn’t help cos you get 15 minutes

However...

Some found the validation & acceptance of staff crucial:

..professional people understanding me well and treating me like a person - not like an inferiority complex or whatever...that's important...They accept me for what I am or as I am (.) and they haven't thrown me out or chucked me on the scrap heap

She made me feel welcome. Cos I did think that she'd like look at me like 'Ah' I dunno, cos I didn't, I never been to one of these sort of places before. I thought she'd look at me like, ... like dirt or somink, but she didn't.

Why do things go wrong?

- One key factor may be the medicalisation of extremes of distress and problematic behaviour
 - produces conditions at odds with those necessary for the repair of shame



Repair of shame

- Articulating & acknowledging shame
- Connection
- Normalising experiences
- Contextualising experiences
- Self-understanding & acceptance
- Empowerment

Diagnostic practices

- Focus on form rather than content
- Distance
- Identifying abnormality
- De-contextualising
- Prioritising professional understandings
- Professional control



Summary & conclusions

- When accessing mental health services, people are often struggling with feelings of shame
- The way in which diagnostic practices structure helping relationships can be problematic for repairing shame
- The recent position statement by the DCP on diagnosis is to be welcomed
 - provides support for alternatives to medical understandings of distress